

Meeting 20

Multi-Stakeholder Steering Committee (MSSC)

Meeting 20

Date: Tuesday, 24th November 2009

Venue: Office of the President

Time: 14:00 hrs

Attendance:

Name	Institution
His Excellency President Jagdeo	Office of the President
Minister Pauline Sukhai	Ministry of Amerindian Affairs
Shyam Nokta	Office of the President
Andrew Bishop	Office of the President
Michael Brotherson	Office of the President
Shereeda Yusuf	Office of the President
Alfred King	Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports
James Singh	Guyana Forestry Commission (GFC)
Hilbertus Cort	Forest Producers Association (FPA)
William Woolford	Guyana Geology and Mines Commission (GGMC)
Indarjit Ramdass	Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Jocelyn Dow	International Institute for Environmental and Development (IIED)
Vanda Radzik	International Institute for Environmental and Development (IIED)
Carvil Duncan	Federation of Independent Trade Unions of Guyana (FITUG)
Gillian Burton	Guyana Trades Union Congress
Gerry Gouveia	Private Sector Commission (PSC)
Hymawattie Lagan	Women's Affairs Bureau
Yvonne Pearson	National Toshias Council (NTC)
Lester Fleming	National Toshias Council (NTC)
Ashton Simon	The National Amerindian Development Foundation (NADF)
Romel Simon	The National Amerindian Development Foundation (TAAMOG)
Peter Persaud	The Amerindian Action Movement of Guyana
Pamela Mendonca	The Amerindian Action Movement of Guyana
Mimi Fernandes	Guyana Organisation of Indigenous People (GOIP)
Joe Singh	Individual Capacity
David James	Individual Capacity

Absent/Excused

Dr. Roger Luncheon	Office of the President	Excused
Minister Robert Persaud	Ministry of Agriculture	Excused
Edward Dreyfus	Office of the President	Excused
Dr. Dindyal Permaul	Ministry of Agriculture	Excused
Patrick Williams	World Wildlife Fund	Excused
Edward Shields	Guyana Gold and Diamond Miners Association	Excused
David Singh	Conservation International	Absent
Sydney Allicock	North Rupununi District Development Board	Absent
Jean La Rose	Amerindian People's Association	Absent by Choice

1. Call to Order

His Excellency President Jagdeo opened the meeting.

2. Announcements and Correspondence

There was one announcement received. It is an invitation from IIED for another dialogue series to be held in Guatemala in 2010.

3. Minutes of Meeting 19

His Excellency invited the MSSC members to go through the Minutes of Meeting 19. The following corrections were identified:

- i. There is one "m" when spelling "Fleming" for Mr. Lester Fleming.
- ii. The 4.10 had an editorial error and the line "Check with Andrew" should be deleted.
- iii. Point 4.20 should read "our Development Bank" instead of "the Development Bank". The Point should state that Norway will not recognise this organisation so it cannot be the recipient of the money.

The minutes were verified as true and correct by Mr. Joe Singh and seconded by Mr. Peter Persaud.

4. Matters Arising from Minutes

- 4.1 Ms. Vanda Radzik stated that she wanted to clarify that in her previous statements that she did not imply that the Minutes of the MSSC were not accurate. Ms. Radzik said that what she meant was that we must try to avoid the perception that a particular NGO is being targeted for attack. Mr. Peter Persaud's comment should be re-worded in the Minutes so it is not portrayed as an attack. Ms. Radzik said she will write a short statement on it but she reiterated that she did not mean to say that whoever is taking the Minutes is not doing a good job

5. Updates and Reports

- 5.1 His Excellency stated that in order to increase Guyana's chance at success in Copenhagen he will be attending the meeting of South American leaders in Manaus and the Commonwealth Heads of Government meeting in Trinidad and Tobago. He noted that CHOGM would deal climate change and UN Secretary General Ban Ki-Moon will be attending that forum. His Excellency said that in general there seems to be some progress on REDD.
- 5.2 Mr. Andrew Bishop said that a non-paper has come out of Barcelona. The issues to be discussed in Copenhagen includes: scope, reference levels, institutional arrangements and financing. Mr. Bishop said he is addressing Guyana's current position on these.
- 5.3 His Excellency asked what reference level is used
- 5.4 Mr. Andrew Bishop said that the historical rate is used as a general reference, but brackets have been included in the text for "expected future emission trends" for the HFLD countries.
- 5.5 His Excellency said that Norway is coming under scrutiny for its MoU with Guyana. The reference level mentioned was 0.45 which is above the 0.3 and this is a big issue with the REDD-Monitor and Europe. Lot of countries argue that historical rate should be the reference level which is a problem for countries like Guyana. The combined historical rate is used in the document where the world average and the historical rate is combined to give the reference level e.g. 0.6 global level and 0.3 in Guyana's case gives 0.9 divided by 2 equals 0.45. It is the combined level that must be used since it is favourable for countries like Guyana with low rate. Some NGOs are opposed to this. Guyana is saying that if the deforestation rate is zero how can you cut from zero or even 0.1? You get locked in and for those countries like Indonesia with a

high deforestation rate any reduction they have will get them benefit. Some NGOs don't know this difference.

His Excellency said that the one reason why Guyana agreed with Norway in this bilateral deal is that there is avoidance of international leakage. There is an overall decline in deforestation rate but because of the stand alone agreement there will not be any leakage.

His Excellency said Norway has an issue with mining and forestry but, they were told that these activities will continue. In fact, there was a discussion in Cabinet about mining and the atrocious behaviour of some miners. There will be lots of changes. His Excellency stated that the Boards for both the mining and forestry sectors will come under review. His Excellency said officers will be held directly responsible for areas they are in charge of as agreed to.

His Excellency said that Global Witness was asked to send all questions raised at the Meeting.

His Excellency stated that REDD-Monitor's statements should be responded to. There are some people who genuinely want it to work and some who don't. It is highly unlikely that these persons can be convinced otherwise.

- 5.6 Ms. Vanda Radzik asked what overall feeling from the London Meeting was.
- 5.7 His Excellency said overall the Meeting went extremely well. He noted that in any audience, there are those who understand and some who don't. It is therefore hard to give background and deal with technical issues at the same time. His Excellency stated that Reuters reporter was seemingly not very familiar with what REDD is yet was there to write a report on it. His Excellency said that he was asked how the reference level is set. If they had read the document they would have seen the arguments for compensating countries with low deforestation rates. His Excellency stated that it is very difficult to go from popular to scientific in a short period of time. Sometimes there is need for background briefing. His Excellency said same problem persisted at the UN Briefing someone asked what does REDD means and he just came from a Meeting on REDD. His Excellency said that Mr. Duncan McQueen made a good presentation, it was really positive.
- 5.8 His Excellency said that someone said that Jagdeo gave company 100ha to grow Paulownia. The President said that lands were given through the Ministry of Agriculture and not by him. He said the lands were Savannahs and there was no cutting down of trees. Rather, the President said that additional funding should be given because it was planting of new trees. His Excellency lamented the kinds of incredulous things that have to be dealt with including the Janet Bulkan article. His Excellency said a link should be sent to everyone on the article. There are a lot of ridiculous comments made in her articles, for example, the comment that the GFC failed to report to the Government about the airstrip bigger than the international airport in the Interior. It was recognised that Guyana can't monitor the forest that's why a MRV System is being developed. His Excellency said that he is informing the MSSC because this should be expected in the upcoming months. His Excellency said that when statements are made to an international audience without their knowing what happened here, the consultations process is carried out by the Government of Guyana is not properly represented by observers like the REDD Monitor. His Excellency said that these persons making the statements should be tackled aggressively in the responses.
- 5.9 Ms. Vanda Radzik asked if Mr. David James can give a summary on his participation in the meeting in Bangkok.
- 5.10 Mr. David James said that he was in Bangkok for one week. At the Conference, there was a large number of indigenous people attended, about 50 different groups but mainly from Asia. It was a two day conference and the participants tried to draft an indigenous position. Mr. James said that he shared the drafted document with Mr. Bishop, which was written and presented to various Governments.
- 5.11 Mr. David James said that the Conference was more general. It looked at discussions at the UNFCCC and the rights of indigenous people. What was done fitted into Guyana. The constitution provides legal guarantees and is well positioned and represented.
- 5.12 Mr. Andrew Bishop stated that the key points raised were: respect for the indigenous people, free prior informed consent and participation of REDD. Mr. Bishop stated Guyana has already accomplished all three points.

- 5.13 Ms. Vanda Radzik enquired if the MSSC can have an update on the revised LCDS.
- 5.14 His Excellency stated that the revised LCDS should be completed by next week.
- 5.15 Ms. Vanda Radzik said that given the dynamic issue of Copenhagen, the revised LCDS should be considered as a living document
- 5.17 His Excellency said that the revised LCDS should be distributed by electronic means. The MoU will be included in the Strategy. It will be an attachment to the LCDS and sections of the Amerindian Act on land rights and procedures for land will be an Addendum in the document rather than have every several paragraphs on land issues.

6 Any Other Business

- 6.1 His Excellency stated that not just on historical method but we have to ensure the methodology is right. His Excellency told the MSSC to go online and read up the UNFCCC Informal Working Group report on Interim Financing for REDD.
- 6.2 Mr. Andrew Bishop said that he has the Informal Working Group's Report.
- 6.3 His Excellency said that the document should be circulated to the MSSC.
- 6.4 Ms. Jocelyn Dow said that CI and WWF can say what their methods are.
- 6.5 His Excellency stated that WWF and CI's are good and are part of the Prince's Rainforest Project. They were both there in London
- 6.6 His Excellency stated that there is a shift from groups of NGOs from the North where shifts to southern NGOs getting more money. This is a big concern for the developed world. But it is important that the NGOs from our part of the world start stepping up and claim space if not these guys will be their voices. People are not familiar with our issues. His Excellency said he does not want to put them down as hostile.
- 6.7 Mr. Gerry Gouveia said that His Excellency is being modest by not considering the NGOs as hostile.
- 6.8 His Excellency stated that when the team goes to Copenhagen they should be able to answer any questions on the MoU between Guyana and Norway. His Excellency said that a few of the delegates will be required to go to Meetings should be able to explain the MoU in details.
- 6.9 His Excellency told Mr. James Singh the Marrakesh Accord needs to be examined since it treats deforestation differently from plantation.
- 6.10 Mr. James Singh said that the issue of MRVS is finalised and on the GFC website. Mr. James Singh said the GFC has to follow the World Bank procedure for tendering
- 6.11 His Excellency enquired how long the procedure will take.
- 6.12 Mr. James Singh stated that the GFC is trying to obtain that information from Mr. Georgio Valentini but the World Bank's track record is a month.
- 6.13 His Excellency said that the GFC should advertise in the newspapers, in the Economist and in another international magazine for about one and half month. The procedure should not be delayed. The GFC should write a letter saying Guyana is going to tender. His Excellency said that momentum should not be lost.

- 6.14 Ms. Vanda Radzik stated that at the forest session in Ghana hosted by IICM Guyana was a model reference. IIED was there and a broad based team. The next Meeting will be in Guatemala and I am sure Guyana will be invited
- 6.15 His Excellency stated that an invitation should be sent to host the Event.
- 6.16 Ms. Vanda Radzik said that the gentleman from the FIP was there and he mentioned that they are interested and have money in hand to give out.
- 6.17 Mr. James Singh said that no money was received from the FCPF not even the promised \$200000.
- 6.18 His Excellency stated that Guyana wants to go alone not with Suriname on the FIP.
- 6.19 Ms. Vanda Radzik asked if Guyana Shields will do something
- 6.20 Mr. Joe Singh said that the Iwokrama system services provided an evaluation in Colombia, French Guiana and here in Guyana.
- 6.21 Mr. Joe Singh said that it is important for direct response to be drafted for the Chris Lang article.
- 6.22 His Excellency stated that the Chris Lang article was correct but in the not context. Basically Norway has another clause not to compensate if it goes beyond the historic level. If it is 0.3 now and the reference level is 0.45 and if in five years the reference level moves to 0.4 then in a longer term agreement the rate of growth is rapid and not good for the long term. There is a double sealing if the emission goes above the 0.3 compensation will be lost but if the emission drops to 0.2 then compensation goes up. It is a great incentive to reduce or stay within the historic level.
- 6.23 Mr. Joe Singh suggested that there be a presentation at the Conference Centre about the revised LCDS and the presentation should have a little more detail for the public on how the \$30 M per year from the MoU between Guyana and Norway will be utilised.
- 6.24 His Excellency stated that it has been agreed that minimum figure of \$5M will be given to Amerindian Communities for their development.
- 6.25 Mr. Joe Singh enquired whether the \$5M is dependent on whether the Amerindian communities "opt in" or "opt out" of the LCDS.
- 6.26 His Excellency stated the money will be given regardless of whether the Amerindian communities "opt in" or "opt out". His Excellency said that at the Cabinet Meeting it was agreed that eighteen communities will benefit from ten tractors which will be costly. His Excellency said that the cost of building roads is too high for Amerindians and there is a big project costing over \$1B but the roads needs to be fixed. This is additional and not bounded by the 5 Mil. I think there's \$2B for the hinterland but other places like Linden and Kwakwani will also receive money.
- 6.27 Mr. Michael Brotherson informed the MSSC that he along with Mr. Andrew Bishop will be making a presentation at Eve Leary to middle level Disciplined Services Officers on Thursday 26 November.
- 6.28 Mr. Andrew Bishop said that there should be a Meeting with the Board of Directors for GGMC and GFC but it has been postponed.

There being no other business, the meeting closed.

End of Minutes

A number of key points were made and follow up action identified. This is summarised below.

Key Points	Follow Up
Answer questions from the Global Witness Meeting in London by the weekend and have it posted on Website	OCC to follow up
Send the web link for the Janet Bulkan article to the MSSC	OCC to follow up
Circulate the paper on the Interim Working Group for REDD to the MSSC	OCC to follow up
The MoU between Guyana and Norway should be examined in details.	MSSC to follow up
The Marrakesh Accord needs to be examined since it treats deforestation differently from plantation.	GFC to follow up
The GFC should advertise in the newspapers, in the Economist and in another international magazine for about one and half month for tendering as part of the World Bank's prerequisite for funding	GFC to follow up