

Meeting 17

Multi-Stakeholder Steering Committee (MSSC)

Meeting 17

Date: Tuesday, 13th October 2009

Venue: Office of the President

Time: 14:00 hrs

Attendance:

Name	Institution
His Excellency President Jagdeo	Office of the President
Minister Robert Persaud	Ministry of Agriculture
Minister Pauline Sukhai	Ministry of Amerindian Affairs
Shyam Nokta	Office of the President
Andrew Bishop	Office of the President
Michael Brotherson	Office of the President
Shereeda Yusuf	Office of the President
Dr. Dindyal Permaul	Ministry of Agriculture
James Singh	Guyana Forestry Commission (GFC)
Hilbertus Cort	Forest Producers Association (FPA)
William Woolford	Guyana Geology and Mines Commission (GGMC)
Indarjit Ramdass	Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Jocelyn Dow	International Institute for Environmental and Development (IIED)
Vanda Radzik	International Institute for Environmental and Development (IIED)
Carvil Duncan	Federation of Independent Trade Unions of Guyana (FITUG)
Gerry Gouveia	Private Sector Commission (PSC)
Yvonne Pearson	National Toshias Council (NTC)
Ashton Simon	The National Amerindian Development Foundation (NADF)
Peter Persaud	The Amerindian Action Movement of Guyana
Mimi Fernandes	Guyana Organisation of Indigenous People (GOIP)
David Singh	Conservation International (CI)
Patrick Williams	World Wildlife Fund (WWF)
Alfred King	Youth Representative

Absent/Excused

Dr. Roger Luncheon	Office of the President	Excused
Joe Singh	Individual Capacity	Excused
Edward Shields	Guyana Gold and Diamond Miners Association	Excused
David James	Individual Capacity	Excused
Lester Flemming	National Toshias Council	Absent
Gillian Burton	Guyana Trade Unions Congress	Absent
Sydney Allicock	North Rupununi District Development Board	Absent
Hymawattie Lagan	Women's Affairs Bureau	Absent
Jean La Rose	Amerindian People's Association	Absent by Choice

Guest

Edward Dreyfus	Office of the President
Romel Simon	The National Amerindian Development Foundation

1. Call to Order

His Excellency President Jagdeo opened the meeting.

2. Announcements and Correspondence

There were no announcements or correspondence.

3. Minutes of Meeting 16

His Excellency invited the MSSC members to go through the Minutes of Meeting 16. There were no corrections identified.

The minutes were verified as true and correct by Mr. Alfred King and seconded by Dr. Dindyal Permaul.

4. Matters Arising from Minutes

4.1 It was noted that point 5.12 in the Minutes of Meeting 16 needed to be expanded and clarified.

5. Updates and Reports

5.1 Minister of Amerindian Affairs, Hon. Pauline Sukhai, updated the MSSC on the meetings between visiting World Bank delegation and sixteen Amerindian communities. The Multi-Stakeholder team consisting of the World Bank team and representatives of civil society, the Government of Guyana, NGOs and donors visited Nappi and Kamarang. The Meeting was open, fair and transparent. Minister Sukhai stated that not surprisingly, the issues raised were not new because these had already been raised at the sub-national consultations. Some of the issues were on land tenure and the need for having more consultations. Minister Sukhai stated that there was an indication of intervention being made to the communities before the Meetings. She said since the Meetings were open to discussion so the perceived intervention did not prejudice the deliberations.

5.2 Ms. Yvonne Pearson stated that it was a privilege for the National Toshau's Council (NTC) to be part of the team that went to Nappi and Kamarang. Ms. Pearson said that the meetings were exemplary in terms of the Amerindian communities having free, prior and informed consent. She said that the villagers expressed themselves freely and in Nappi there was support for the LCDS. She noted that while in Kamarang the residents had more 'energy', the major issue for her were the points relating to the support for the LCDS.

5.3 His Excellency told the MSSC that he too had informed the World Bank (WB) that the issues that were raised in the Nappi and Kamarang were not new. The Head of State recalled that the issues had been raised in the other extensive consultations and these matters would be taken into account when finalising the LCDS. His Excellency noted that there was concern raised on revenue sharing and he reaffirmed that every cent derived from the indigenous people's lands will go back to them. The President said that how much money will go to the village and to other villages without forests is still to be determined and that decision will not be made by the Government. Additionally, some of the money garnered from the State Forests will also go to the Indigenous People. His Excellency said that it is important that the work done at the Sub-National Consultations is not overshadowed by the World Bank's Meetings since the World Bank's resources are very small. The WB intends to give \$3.4M but, on an annual basis it is estimated that Guyana will need \$500M. Notwithstanding this fact though, Guyana needs to work with WB in a collaborative way even though the MoU with Norway is estimated to give ten times the amount of the WB. The WB is important but is a tiny component for the LCDS. However, Guyana will not "jump through hoops" for the \$3.4M when Norway is prepared to give Guyana more money with less conditionality. His Excellency stated that this World Bank team seems more inclined to compromise.

- 5.4 Ms. Vanda Radzik enquired about the issue of the land claims in Region 8 by several Amerindian communities and whether there can be some indication of a willingness to resolve this.
- 5.5 His Excellency responded to Ms. Radzik stating that the State will not be processing block claims. If each village submits a claim, the Government will process this in accordance with the requirements of the Amerindian Act which is very explicit about the process and the time frame for Government's action and response.
- 5.6 Ms. Jocelyn Dow stated that at the meeting in Kamarang there was a request for a factsheet on the LCDS. Ms. Dow also stated that maybe a "Frequently Wrong Questions" booklet to clarify questions people raised should be produced.
- 5.7 His Excellency stated that through the World Bank FCPS, some of the funds will be channelled to the National Toshias Council and which can be used to continue raising awareness and include activities such as printing preparing Fact Sheets etc.
- 5.8 Mr. Ashton Simon informed the MSSC that the Report for the Awareness Sessions in Regions 7&8 showed that there were over 720 persons at the sessions. Mr. Simon stated that the issues raised at the sessions were not new or isolated. All the issues were repeated from the Sub-National Consultations.
- 5.9 Mr. Peter Persaud stated that the comments/questions raised at the Awareness Sessions in Regions 7&8 showed that there was "misleading machinery" in the area prior to the visit. In Nappi, the APA was telling persons not to agree with the LCDS.
- 5.10 His Excellency stated that it was unfortunate that this interference was occurring. He said that at the National Toshias Council (NTC), the Toshias were overwhelmingly positive with the LCDS.
- 5.11 Ms. Vanda Radzik enquired if any declaration had emerged from the NTC.
- 5.12 His Excellency stated that there was no declaration made at the NTC because the Government is not pushing for anyone to 'opt in'.
- 5.13 Mr. James Singh said that there is a general consensus to support the LCDS. Mr. Singh wanted to thank civil society, NGOs, the Government and others for their efforts in the process.
- 5.14 Mr. Ashton Simon stated that in response to Mr. Singh, at the WB Meeting there was confusion on who made the decision for visiting Nappi and Kamarang.
- 5.15 His Excellency stated that Nappi and Kamarang were "trouble spots". The meeting agreed that in the areas in North Rupununi there is overwhelming support for the LCDS.
- 5.16 Mr. James Singh stated that the GFC had chosen Bina Hill to visit.
- 5.17 His Excellency said that the World Bank should not portray Guyana based on the communities they visited and pointed out that Nappi and Kamarang were not excluded from the Sub-National Consultations.
- 5.18 His Excellency pointed out that before this growing awareness on climate change Prime Minister Gordon Brown had stated that the World Bank could become a bank for the environment but now the British are shifting their position. His Excellency informed that the WB needs to make a case that they are the right institution through which billions of dollars can be channelled. He noted that it can be as much as \$150 billion a year, making them a powerful institution. However, their track record does not reflect this. He noted that the publicity such as the press conference, to be held later today, is good for the WB's image. Additionally, Guyana can benefit from the press conference as being portrayed as one of the lead countries addressing this matter. His Excellency stated that the WB needs Guyana as much as Guyana needs them. There were three countries the WB had to work with in the FCPF but Panama and Indonesia are not moving forward so Guyana is the WB's only hope to reach an agreement with before Copenhagen, where

they will be under intense scrutiny as vying to be the right institution to handle the financing relating to climate change.

Report from the I-NGOs Awareness Sessions in Regions 7&8

- 5.19 Mr. Ashton Simon informed the MSSC that the Awareness Sessions held in Regions 7 & 8 were successful. He noted that the I-NGOs recognise that they have done a great job and the aim of the awareness sessions was achieved.

Report from Drafting Committee

- 5.20 Mr. Shyam Nokta informed the MSSC that the combined matrix of all responses was separated to 10 Thematic Areas identified by the Drafting Committee, and responses were analysed. This process was completed last Friday whereby for each Thematic Area, the Lead Person and Team reported on the analysis of the responses and the highlighted areas for inclusion in the revised LCDS. These were passed on to the authors of the LCDS to be included in the revised LCDS.
- 5.21 His Excellency stated that the section on land issues should be redrafted and placed in the Annex and there should be an extended section in the Strategy on the issue of revenue sharing.
- 5.22 Ms. Vanda Radzik enquired if the Drafting Committee will have an opportunity to review the finalised version of the Strategy.
- 5.23 His Excellency stated that the finalised version of the LCDS will be circulated to the MSSC for their review.

Report from UN Climate Change Negotiations

- 5.24 Mr. Andrew Bishop updated the MSSC on the UN Climate Change Negotiations. Mr. Bishop stated that he will focus on two segments of the negotiations – REDD and the Kyoto Protocol. With respect to the other areas on technology transfer and adaptation, Mr. Bishop stated that negotiations in these areas are going well relative to Guyana's position. He noted that there is easy and direct access for a number of financial facilities with various modalities and timelines.

Mr. Bishop stated that during the negotiations, it was made clear that every time REDD was discussed Guyana will stand up and articulate our position. The general agreement at REDD was that the plus for REDD [forest conservation and avoided deforestation] should be included. He stated that there should be phased funding for REDD, initially a fund approach and subsequently a market based mechanism.

Mr. Bishop said that as a result of the interventions that Guyana made at the meeting, Guyana was invited as co-chair for the REDD drafting committee. He further stated that the acceptance of REDD is key for an agreement in Copenhagen and further work on REDD is still needed and has not concluded. This work should be tied to the Bali Action Plan. On the issues of emission cuts, Mr. Bishop said that the Kyoto Protocol binds 37 industrial countries to meet targets for cuts in emission by 2012, this is the first commitment. The second agreement is now being negotiated. In Bangkok, Norway announced their target of 40%. It is the highest for the developed countries. Japan set a 25% cut. Overall the pledges reach 20% but it is still below what is required.

- 5.25 His Excellency stated that Norway's pledge is conditional; and if it is taken into account then the EU's pledge should be included. So far, the pledges have not shifted significantly.
- 5.26 Mr. Bishop stated that developed countries that were in Bangkok were not interested in the second phase of the Kyoto Protocol. The US insisted on having a single agreement for all countries to get China and India involved. The negotiations ended in an impasse. Mr. Bishop stated that if the US does not come on board others will not follow suit and there will be no deal. He stated that Denmark wants an outcome in December but if an agreement is rushed, a political outcome in the form of a declaration will be the weak outcome. Mr. Bishop said that the question is "do we want the negotiations to go a little longer and get a better outcome?" Mr. Bishop stated that President Barack Obama was just awarded the Nobel Peace Prize and will receive it at the

same time that COP will be held and when President Obama goes to Copenhagen, there will be a moral obligation for the US to do something.

6 Any Other Business

- 6.1 Mr. Ashton Simon stated that in the I-NGOs' report from their awareness sessions in Regions 7&8 there is a recommendation to have one rep from each of the NGOs go to Copenhagen.
- 6.2 His Excellency stated that Ms. Yvonne Pearson as head of the National Toshihos Council will be on the team that will go to Copenhagen. His Excellency said that accommodation is a challenge but efforts could be made to explore options for wider participation.
- 6.3 Ms. Mimi Fernandes stated that she received an email from COICA enquiring about the outreach programme recently conducted by the I-NGOs. COICA requested Ms. Fernandes to give her opinion on the sessions held.
- 6.4 His Excellency stated that Ms. Fernandes should reply to COICA as a member of the MSSC and as part of the I-NGOs team. His Excellency said that Ms. Fernandes should indicate how the awareness sessions were financed and Ms. Fernandes should email a copy of the I-NGOs' report to COICA.
- 6.5 Mr. Peter Persaud stated that COICA produced a document that contained misleading statements on the rights of the indigenous people.
- 6.6 Ms. Mimi Fernandes said that at the Guiana Shield Meeting, before she was a part of the MSSC, she was informed on anti-carbon, anti- REDD ideas. Ms. Fernandes stated that she was against REDD and the LCDS then. At the time, Ms. Fernandes was the representative for GOIP but did not have authority to sign on the documents presented. Ms. Fernandes reiterated that it was a very different and negative view presented on REDD and LCDS.
- 6.7 Mr. Ashton Simon stated that in part of the REDD document it is stated that indigenous people will have to minimise farming.
- 6.8 His Excellency stated that the countries that will be providing funds for keeping standing forests will only pay if the trees are not cut down. His Excellency said that Guyana will advocate that rotational agriculture is sustainable.
- 6.9 Ms. Jocelyn Dow stated that the UNDP is funding a women and climate change forum on the 19th October.
- 6.10 Ms. Vanda Radzik informed the MSSC that Global Witness is keen on organising an advocacy event in London. Ms. Radzik said that Global Witness has sent an email which was forwarded to Mr. Shyam Nokta requiring an update on the likely time of the event. It will be ideal to set it on the Agenda for sometime at end of October to November but will depend on His Excellency's schedule.
- 6.11 His Excellency stated that there is a Report on Commission of Climate and Tropical Forests which is very supportive of REDD.

There being no other business, the meeting closed.

End of Minutes

A number of key points were made and follow up action identified. This is summarised below.

Key Points	Follow Up
Circulate the Report on Climate and Tropical Forests to the MSSC.	OCC to follow up
The I-NGOs' Draft Report for their awareness sessions held in Regions 7&8 should be posted on the LCDS website	OCC to follow up
For the finalised draft of the LCDS the part on land issues should be cleaned up and included in the Annex and there should be an expanded area on revenue sharing in the document.	OCC to follow up
The dates for the advocacy event organised by Global Witness needs to be set	OCC to follow up